## **Replies to comments on "a bibliometric study of earthquake research: 1900–2010"**

Xingjian Liu · F. Benjamin Zhan · Song Hong · Beibei Niu · Yaolin Liu

Received: 6 November 2012/Published online: 29 November 2012 © Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest, Hungary 2012

Our analysis—as many other bibliometric studies—focused on aggregated and overall patterns in scientific development. It is our belief that, as long as the bibliometric samples are selected in a rational, representative, and consistent manner, the exact number of articles in a sample is not a significant concern.

The 84,051 papers reported in the article included (1) 81,409 papers indexed in 1900–2010 and (2) 2,642 papers then indexed in the early months of 2011, when the data collection was performed in April and May of 2011. These 2,642 papers were aggregated in the section *Document types and languages of the article*, but not elsewhere. Nevertheless, (1) our analyses, conjectures, and conclusions remain intact, as other parts of the paper are based on yearly data (focusing on papers published prior to 2011); and (2) the relative distribution of article types and languages in different categories will not be affected, even if we separate these 2,642 papers in the analysis.<sup>1</sup>

The consistency of our searching strategy was confirmed by four independent checks. With our reported searching strategy, we located 81,845, 81,397, 82,020, and 80,667 publications for the period of 1900–2010 in searches performed in four university libraries in Canada, the US, and the UK (Fig. 1) during October 26–27, 2012. All four results (81,845, 81,397, 82,020, and 80,667) are close to the original number of 81,409 stated in the article (accessed in May 2011; with less than 0.9 % differences), and the differences

## X. Liu

F. B. Zhan

S. Hong  $\cdot$  B. Niu  $\cdot$  Y. Liu ( $\boxtimes$ )

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The original dataset is available from the authors on request.

This paper is submitted under the Editor's request, as a reply to a comment on our previous paper "a bibliometric study of earthquake research: 1900–2010".

Department of Geography, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK

Department of Geography, Texas Center for Geographic Information Science, Texas State University-San Marcos, San Marcos, TX, USA

School of Resource and Environmental Science, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China e-mail: yaolin610@163.com

Sign In Marke	d List (0)   My EndNote Web   My ResearcherID   My Citation A	Nerts   My Saved Searches   Log Out
All Databases Select a Dat	abase Web of Science Additional Resource	
Search Author Search Cited	Reference Search Advanced Search History	
Web of Science®		
Results Topic=("earthqual	ke" or "seismoloav" or "seismic" or "auake") AND Year Publish	ed=
(1900-2010)		Scientific WebPlu
Lemmatization=On	atabases=SCI-EXPANDED, SSCI.	View Web Results >
Create Alert / RSS		
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845	earch term (for example, tooth and teeth) may have been applied, in panthe terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemma"	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 B OF KNOWLEDC	earch term (for example, both and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemma Id I Page 1 of 8,185	Sort by: Publication Date newest to obtact
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 EB OF KNOWLEDC	earch term (for example, both and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemms exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemms exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemms of 8,185 @	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  My Clation Arets My Saved Searches   Log Out
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC	earch term (for example, both and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemms	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC Databases Sefect a Database W sardh Author Search Coted Reference Search	earch term (for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemms	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest O My Cladon Avents My Saved Searches Log Out
Note: Alternative forms of your s contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 EB OF KNOWLEDC Databases Sefect a Batabase W sarch Author Search Cated Reference Sear Web of Science	earch term (for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn of the "Lemma If I Page 1 of 8,185 DISCOVERY STARTS HERE Sign In   Marked List (0)   My Endlede Web   My Researched eb of Science of Advanced Search   Search History	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest O My Clution Aierts   My Saved Searches   Log Out
Note: Alternative forms of your's contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC Databases Sefect a Database We and Author Search Cotted Reference Sear We of Science® Results Topics ("carthquaker" or "Sectors	earch term, for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn of the "Lemma If I Page 1 of 8,185  Son by the "Lemma DISCOVERY STARTS HERE Son by Marked List (0) My End Kile Web My Researched of Science Additional Researces on Advanced Search Search Researces on Advanced Search Search History Song or "Researce" or "quarke") AKD Year Published=(1500-2010)	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest O Ny Obtion Alerts   My Saved Bearches   Log Out
Note: Alternative forms of your's contain quotation marks around Results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC Databases Sefect a Database W arch Adhor Bearch Cated Reference Bear Web of Science Results Topic "("earthquake" or "setsmol Temperand Topic ("earthquake" or "setsmol Temperand Topic ("earthquake" or "setsmol Cated Reference Cated Cated Reference Cated Results Topic ("earthquake" or "setsmol Cated Reference Cated Cat	earch term, for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn of the "Lemma DISCOVERY STARTS HERE Sign In   Market List (0)   My End Kite Web   My Researched eb of Science of Additional Researces of Additional Researces of Additional Researces of Additional Researces of Additional Researces	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  My Clution Averts   My Saved Searches   Log Out    Scientific WebPlus Wew Web Results
Note: Alternative forms of yours contain quotation marks around results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC Databases Select a Database W Contained a contained and a contained and a Author Search Cate Reference Sear Web of Science Contained and an assess-SCO Contained and an assess-SCO	earch term, for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn of the "Lemma If I page f of 8,185 @  If I have been applied in particular for Topic or Tiles searches that do no income for the search page.	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest O My Citation Alerts My Saved Bearches Log Out  Scientific WebPlus View Web Results Scientific WebPlus View Web Results to contain quotation marks around the terms. To find only exact
Note: Alternative forms of yours contain quotation marks around results: 81,845 BOF KNOWLEDC Databases Select a Database W sarch Author Search Cites Reference Sear Net of Secret Cites Reference Sear Net of Secret Cites Reference Sear There are antiquiset or "Section There are antiquiset or "Section The area of the Cites Antiquiset or Section The area of the Cites Antiquiset or Section The Cites Antiquis	earch term, for example, looth and teeth) may have been applied, in part the terms. To find only exact matches for your terms, turn of the "Lemma If I Page f of 8,185 @ I Market List (0) My End tote Web My Researched te of Science Additional Resources of Adaptional Resources (a) Adaptional Resources (b) Adaptional Resources (c) Adaptional Resource	Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  Sort by: Publication Date newest to oldest  My Citation Alerts My Saved Bearches Log Out    My Citation Alerts My Saved Bearches Log Out    Scientific WebPlus View Web Results  scientific WebPlus View Web Results  to contain quotation marks around the terms. To tind only exact  Sort by: Publication Date newest to state

Sign In | Search History | Help Home : Web of Science® Topic=("earthquake" or "seismiology" or "seismic" or "quake") AND Year Published=(1900-2010) AND Year Published=(1900-2010)

Results: 80,677 Refine

I Databases Select a Database Web of Science Adds	ional Resources			
Search Author Search Cited Ridletence Search Advanced Search (Search Hist	ory			
Web of Science®				
Results Topic+("earthquake" or "seismology" or "seismic" or "quake") ANE Temper-AH "Vers Osteleses-SO-DPAROED, SO: Leverature-DP- Comer Alert (Carso	D Year Published=(1900-2010)	Scientific WebPlan View Web Results		
Note: Alternative forms of your search term (for example, tooth and teeth) may have bee the search page.	in applied, in particular for Topic or Tille searches that do not contain guidation mama around the terms. To f	ind only exact matches for your terms, turn off the "Lemmatization" option on		
Results: 82,020	d -d Page 1 of 8.202 (60) > >	Sort by: Publication Date - new set to object 💌		

Fig. 1 Five independent checks with our reported searching strategy on the same day from five university libraries in Canada, UK and US



Fig. 2 A comparison of different implementations of the report search strategy

between these numbers are due to the fact that SCI/SSCI databases are continuously updated with minor changes over time.

The differences between the number of articles reported by the authors and Professor Ho are probably due to different implementations of the searching strategy (Fig. 2). The selection of keywords was informed by the authors' geological backgrounds. To ensure the robustness of search results, we purposely enforced a tighter condition by including quotation marks. From a statistical sampling perspective, even if we deemed the publications resulted from a relaxed search (as reported by Professor Ho) as the true *population* and the publications resulted from the tightened search (as reported by us) as the *sample*, our analysis would be robust with a sampling rate greater than 90 %. In addition, either using the tighter or relaxed searching strategy, the resulting sample sizes are significantly larger than those used in previous studies on similar topics (for example, Chiu and Ho 2007; Li et al. 2009; Taskin 2010).

We agree that data in 1990–2010 are more reliable, as for example, we have restricted our growth analysis to this period. However, our conjecture focused the propelling effect of major earthquakes, i.e., whether earthquake-related studies are stimulated by major earthquakes, but not on the specific number of papers related to the Loma Prieta earthquake or any other earthquake. Similar observations were made by other researchers (Li et al. 2009; Taskin 2010). In addition to the Loma Prieta earthquake, we have listed other examples to support our conjecture, such as the Indian Ocean Earthquake in 2004 and the Haiti Earthquake in 2010.

Professor Ho was not directly involved in the preparation of this article in any way. We acknowledged Professor Ho for his pioneering contribution to the general field of bibliometrics, i.e., the excel-based bibliometrics that he developed. Please note that Professor Ho's publication on a similar topic was properly cited in the article (Chiu and Ho 2007).

## References

Chiu, W. T., & Ho, Y. S. (2007). Bibliometric analysis of tsunami research. Scientometrics, 73, 3-17.

- Li, Y., Wen, J., Du, L., Gao, Z., Li, L., Chen, Q., et al. (2009). A comparative study on earthquake-related literature published in medical journals. *Journal of Evidence-Based Medicine*, 2, 252–257.
- Taskin, Z. (2010). Contribution of Turkish scholars to earthquake literature: the impact of the Marmara earthquake. *Communications in Computer and Information Science*, *96*, 222–223.